

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

A victim of the Occam's razor.

This is the author's manuscript

Original Citation:

Availability:

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/144886> since

Published version:

DOI:10.1007/s11739-013-0954-6

Terms of use:

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)



UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO

This is an author version of the contribution published on:

Elia F, Pagnozzi F, Laface B, Apra F, Roccatello D
A victim of the Occam's razor.
INTERNAL AND EMERGENCY MEDICINE (2013) 8
DOI: 10.1007/s11739-013-0954-6

The definitive version is available at:

<http://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/s11739-013-0954-6>

A victim of the Occam's razor

Fabrizio Elia, Fiammetta Pagnozzi, Barbara Laface, Franco Aprà, Dario Roccatello.

F. Elia, F. Pagnozzi, B. Laface, F. Aprà High Dependency Unit, San Giovanni Bosco Hospital,
Piazza Donatore del Sangue 3, 10154 Turin, Italy
e-mail: fabrizioelia@yahoo.it

D. Roccatello

Department of Rare, Immunologic, Haematologic and Immunohaematologic Diseases, Center for Immunopathology and Rare Diseases, San G Bosco Hospital and University of Turin, Piazza Donatore del Sangue 3, 10154 Turin, Italy

Conflict of interest None.

Keywords : Diagnostic error, Fever of unknown origin, Anti-glomerular basement membrane disease

Dear Editor,

In November 2011, a 31-year-old man was admitted to our hospital with fever and acute renal failure. Two months before, he had been diagnosed with methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* aortic valve endocarditis requiring valve replacement. Heart surgery was performed without complications, and antibiotic therapy was started. 40 days after surgery, he became febrile and a diagnosis of prosthetic valve endocarditis was suspected. A transesophageal echocardiogram did not reveal new signs of endocarditis. Blood cultures were negative. The initial antibiotic therapy was empirically changed, and gentamicin was administered. After 2 weeks the patient developed acute anuric renal failure. At this time he was transferred to our hospital. On arrival the patient was febrile. Physical examination showed neither new cardiac abnormalities nor signs of systemic embolization. Blood test yielded a leucocytosis, renal failure and mild elevation of procalcitonin levels. CT scan of his head, chest and abdomen were negative for septic emboli. Transesophageal echocardiogram revealed the aortic prosthesis to be functioning normally in the absence of clear vegetations. Blood cultures were negative.

Although there was no evidence of sources of infection, fever was considered to be of infectious origin, and the renal failure was attributed to aminoglycoside nephrotoxicity.

Gentamicin was discontinued, antibiotic therapy was changed again, and hemodialysis was started.

Over the following days, the patient had one episode of severe hemoptysis associated with respiratory failure and blood loss. A CT scan of the chest showed diffuse interstitial and alveolar infiltrates suggestive of alveolar hemorrhage.

At this point, a diagnosis of a pulmonary renal syndrome was suspected. Autoimmune tests were performed showing high titers of anti-glomerular basement membrane (anti-GBM) antibodies. A diagnosis of Goodpasture syndrome was made. The patient was administered prednisone and rituximab (preferred to other immunosuppressive drugs to minimize the risk of infection) and underwent a series of 19 plasma-exchange treatments.

Clinical conditions improved, no further episodes of hemoptysis occurred, and, at the time of discharge, anti-GBM antibodies were undetectable. However, the patient became dependent on chronic hemodialysis.

Goodpasture syndrome is an autoimmune disease characterized by pulmonary hemorrhage, glomerulonephritis and the presence of circulating anti-GBM antibodies.

Infection may be an initiating event or a precipitating factor for relapse. Identifying Goodpasture syndrome following an infectious event is challenging and high procalcitonin values may be observed even in the absence of infection [1]. In presence of a typical presentation including alveolar hemorrhage and renal failure, the evidence of circulating anti-GBM antibodies may confirm the diagnosis.

Life-saving treatment includes plasma-exchange to remove circulating antibodies and immunosuppressive medications to stop the production of the antibodies.

Occam's razor, also known as principle of parsimony, is a cognitive shortcut commonly used by physicians in their diagnostic reasoning. This logical device advocates that the doctor should not search for multiple causes of any condition if a single cause can provide a suitable explanation.

As well as other cognitive shortcuts, Occam's razor may help physicians when they are making decisions in the presence of multiple clinical informations [2]. Unfortunately sometimes this diagnostic approach may lead to a misdiagnosis [3].

In our case, although no sources of infection were identified, fever of infectious origin was considered as the most probable diagnosis for a patient recently undergoing cardiac surgery because of endocarditis. The correct diagnosis was not considered until our patient developed a further complication. This approach led to a treatment delay resulting in poor renal outcome and need for chronic hemodialysis.

Our case constitutes a diagnostic challenge and raises the problem of cognitive errors in medical diagnostic reasoning.

References

1. Morath C, Sis J, Haensch GM, Zeier M, Andrassy K, Schwenger V (2007) Procalcitonin as marker of infection in patients with Goodpasture's syndrome is misleading. *Nephrol Dial Transplant* 22:2701–2704
2. Schattner A (2009) As sharp as Occam? *Lancet* 373:1996
3. Neira MI, Sa´nchez J, Moreno I, Chiaraviglio A, Rayo A, Gutie´rrez J et al (2006) Occam can be wrong: a young man with lumbar pain and acute weakness of the legs. *Lancet* 367:540