## Scientific Advisory Panel on the Evidence Base for Patient and Family Engaged Care

### NAM SAP Goals

- Support NAM's aim to facilitate the advancement of patient and family engaged care by building and disseminating the evidence base for the tools, strategies, and culture required,
- Identify research/researchers who can contribute to the evidence base for this work,
- Develop a common understanding of essential elements for creating and sustaining patient and family engaged culture,
- Establish a process for sharing and compiling existing and emerging research in support of these essential elements.



# Scientific Advisory Panel for Patient and Family Engaged Care

- Jim Atty, Waverly Health Center
- Bruce J. Avolio, PhD, University of Washington
- Michael Barry, MD, Healthwise; Professor of Medicine, part-time, Harvard Medical School
- Julie Béliveau, MBA, DBA, Université de Sherbrooke
- Sheila Bosch, PhD, LEED AP, EDAC, University of Florida
- Eric A. Coleman, MD, MPH, University of Colorado, Denver
- Susan Frampton, PhD, Planetree -- CHAIR
- Dominick Frosch, PhD, Palo Alto Medical Foundation Research Institute
- Sara Guastello, Planetree
- Jill Harrison, PhD, Planetree
- Judith Hibbard, DrPH, University of Oregon
- Mohammadreza Hojat, PhD, Thomas Jefferson University

- Libby Hoy, PFCCpartners
- Harlan M. Krumholz, MD, SM, Yale University
- Laura McClelland, PhD, Virginia Commonwealth University
- Mary Naylor, PhD, FAAN, RN, University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing
- David P. Rakel, MD, University of New Mexico
- Helen Riess, MD, Harvard Medical School, Mass.
   General Hospital; Chief Scientist, Empathetics Inc.
- Ann-Marie Rosland, MD, MS, University of Michigan Medical School and Research Scientist, VA Center for Clinical Management Research
- Joel Seligman, Northern Westchester Hospital
- Sue Sheridan, MBA, MIM, DHL, PCORI
- Jean-Yves Simard, Université de Montréal
- Tim Smith, MPH, Sharp Memorial Hospital
- Susan Stone, PhD RN NEA-BC, Sharp Coronado Hospital
- Carol Wahl, RN, MSN, MBA, CHI Good Samaritan



## Deliverable #1: Guiding Framework for Patient and Family Engaged Care



#### Leadership

- Commitment to change
- Leadership vision and behaviors aligned with PFEC
- · PFEC as strategic priority

#### Levers for Change

- · Assessment of current state
- · Change champions
- Industry, business, policy and payer incentives for PFEC

#### Structures

- · Shared governance
- Promoting transparency, visibility & inclusion among personnel and patients/families
- Fostering dialogue between clinical researchers and patients/families
- Interdisciplinary and cross-sector teams
- Cross-continuum collaboration
- PFEC-aligned personnel management practices
- Built environment that facilitates PFEC

#### Skills and Awareness Building

- Training to expand partnership capabilities of healthcare personnel and patients/families
- Development, sharing, translation of research

#### Connections

- Connection of skill-building for personnel and patients/families
- Experiential learning
- Connection to purpose

#### Practices

- Promoting patient and family engagement
- Attending to the emotional, social and spiritual needs of patients/families and personnel
- Engaging patients/families in research activities

#### **Better Engagement**

- · Patient/family activation
- · Increased family presence
- · Increased feelings of autonomy

#### **Better Decisions**

- · Improved health confidence
- Improved decision quality

#### **Better Processes**

- · Improved care coordination
- Culture of safety

#### **Better Experience**

- Improved sleep
- Reduced stress
- Improved communication
- Decreased grievances and malpractice claims

#### **Better Culture**

- · Joy in practice
- · Increased compassion
- · Improved staff experience
- · Improved staff retention
- · Reduced burnout/stress

#### **Better Health**

- · Improved patient-defined outcomes
- Increased patient self-management
- · Improved quality of life
- · Reduced illness burden

#### **Better Care**

- · Care plans match patient goals
- · Improved symptom management
- Improved safety
- · Improved transitions
- · Decreased readmissions
- · Improved patient experience

#### **Lower Costs**

- · Decreased utilization and length of stay
- Improved efficiency
- Lower healthcare costs
- Better value for patients and families



## From High Level

Broad overview of the framework with core elements of each transformational stage delineated



Delineation of core elements of each transformational stage

MONITORING		DATA COLLECTION					
ORGANIZATIONAL FOUNDATIONS	STRATEG	STRATEGIC INPUTS		PRACTICE OUTPUTS		ENGAGEMENT OUTCOMES	
Leadership	Structures	Skill & Awareness Building	Better Engagement	<b>Better Decisions</b>	Better Culture	Better Health	
Levers for Change	Practices	Connections	Better Experience	<b>Better Processes</b>	Lower Costs	Better Care	
INCREASING CO-CREATION			CONTINUOUS FEEDBACK				

# To a more detailed implementation plan

#### Leadership

- · Commitment to change
- Leadership vision and behaviors aligned with PFEC
- · PFEC as strategic priority

#### Levers for Change

- · Assessment of current state
- · Change champions
- Industry, business, policy and payer incentives for PFEC

#### **Structures**

- Shared governance
- Promoting transparency, visibility & inclusion among personnel and patients/families
- Fostering dialogue between clinical researchers and patients/families
- Interdisciplinary and cross-sector teams
   Cross-continuum collaboration
- PFEC-aligned personnel management practices
- Built environment that facilitates PFEC

#### Skills and Awareness Building

- Training to expand partnership capabilities of healthcare personnel and patients/families
- Development, sharing, translation of research

#### Connections

- Connection of skill-building for personnel and patients/families
- Experiential learning
- · Connection to purpose

#### Practices

- Promoting patient and family engagement
- Attending to the emotional, social and spiritual needs of patients/families and personnel
- Engaging patients/families in research activities

#### **Better Engagement**

- · Patient/family activation
- · Increased family presence
- · Increased feelings of autonomy

#### **Better Decisions**

- · Improved health confidence
- · Improved decision quality

#### **Better Processes**

- Improved care coordination
- · Culture of safety

#### **Better Experience**

- Improved sleep
- Reduced stress
- · Improved communication
- Decreased grievances and malpractice claims

#### **Better Culture**

- Joy in practice
- · Increased compassion
- · Improved staff experience
- · Improved staff retention
- · Reduced burnout/stress

#### **Better Health**

- · Improved patient-defined outcomes
- Increased patient self-management
- · Improved quality of life
- Reduced illness burden

#### **Better Care**

- · Care plans match patient goals
- · Improved symptom management
- Improved safety
- Improved transitions
- Decreased readmissions
- Improved patient experience

#### Lower Costs

- · Decreased utilization and length of stay
- Improved efficiency
- Lower healthcare costs
- · Better value for patients and families

NOTE: linear placement of each bucket is not meant to suggest order or hierarchy

## **Deliverable #2:** *NAM Perspectives* discussion paper and supporting literature

#### DISCUSSION PAPER

PREPUBLICATION COPY - DO NOT DISTRIBUTE

#### Harnessing Evidence and Experience to Change Culture: A Guiding Framework for Patient and Family Engaged Care

Susan B. Frampton, Ph.D., Planetree; Sara Guastello, Planetree; Libby Hoy, PFCCpartners; Mary Naylor, Ph.D., F.A.A.N., R.N., University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing; Sue Sheridan, M.B.A., M.I.M., D.H.L., Patient- Centered Outcomes Research Institute; Michelle Johnston-Fleece, M.P.H., National Academy of Medicine

January 2017

ABSTRACT | Patient and family engaged care (PFEC) is care families (as defined by the patient) in a work and trained preferences, values, and desired health out make it is nepresents a shift in the role patients and families along in ar le ns, as well as in ongoing quality impatients and families play in driven in any centre as well as in ongoing quality improvement and complete in the presents an important shift from cesses to aligning those processes to best address the matter to patients. In a culture of PFEC, patients are not merely bealth o spectators of their care; they are active participants whose voices are orared. Patients' (and their families') expertise about their bodies, lifestyles, and priorities is incorporated into care planning. Their care experience is valued and incorporated into improvement efforts.

A prevalent and persistent challenge to a system-wide high-impact elements necessary to create and sustain cally speaking, to make it happen.

ence-Driven Health System convened a Scientific Advisory Panel (SAP) to compile and disseminate important insights on culture change strategies. The SAP's focus and family engagement and are tied to research find- identified as a cornerstone of the national strategy evidence and the lived experiences of patients, fami- to promote PFCC have focused primarily on changlies, practitioners, and leaders to develop a compre- ing behaviors of patients (and, increasingly, families).

transformation to PFEC is uncertainty about whether a culture of PFEC. Research in support of the various the resource investment required will lead to better elements of the model was then compiled into a seresults. There is also a lack of clarity about how, practi- lected bibliography. This paper introduces the framework and associated evidence, along with practical ex-To address these barriers, the National Academy of amples of elements of the model applied in the "real Medicine's Leadership Consortium for a Value & Sci. world "with the goal of supporting action that will pave the way for PFEC to become the norm in health care.

was on evidence-based strategies that facilitate patient Patient and family centered care (PFCC) has been ings revealing improved patient care and outcomes. To for delivering better care and achieving better patient achieve this goal, the SAP drew on both the scientific experiences at lower cost. Until fairly recently, efforts hensive framework that explicitly identifies specific, These endeavors simultaneously treated patients as PREPUBLICATION COPY - DO NOT DISTRIBUTE

Adams, J.R., Elwyn, G., Légaré, F. Archives of Internal Medicine 13 Ajiboye, F., Dong, F., Moore, J., N Communication, HERD: Health E

Arterhurn D. Wellman P. Westhr to sharply lower hip and knee su Atwood KA, Shamblen SR, Gaude 7in Driving Transformation in He Balogun, J. (2003). From blaming

Balogun, J. et Johnson, G. (2004) 523-549 Barrett B. Havney MS. Muller D.

CL. Meditation or exercise for pr Barry MJ, Wescott PH, Reifler EJ. perform a prostate-specific antig Bauer, B, Mitchell, C, Salmon, E.

Orthopedic Patients." Patient Ext Bauer, B. Mitchell, C. Salmon, E. Orthopedic Patients." The Beryl Béliveau, J. (2013). Middle mana

1345-1362. Béliveau, J. (2015). Model basec Conference in Boston, on Octobe Biddiss, E., McPherson, A., Shea,

children. HERD: Health Environn Bosch, S., Bledsoe, T., & Jenzarli, Bozic KJ, Belkora J, Chan V, Youn patients with osteoarthritis of the Brown, M. and Cregan, C. (2008)

667-686. Human Resource Management, Burnes, B. and Jackson, P. (2011)

Management, 11(2), 133-162. Center for Leadership Studies &

Choi, Y.-S., & Bosch, S. J. (2012). Comm J Qual Patient Saf. 2015 N Coleman EA, Min SJ. Patients' an

2015:34(3-4):173-84. Coleman EA, Parry C, Chalmers S 25:166(17):1822-8.

Coleman EA, Roman SP, Hall KA, Healthc Qual, 2015 Jan-Feb; 37(1 Coleman EA. Roman SP. Family c

Coleman EA. Extending simulatic Coulmont M. Roy C & Dumas L. ( care manager 32(1) 87-95 Del Canale S, Louis DZ, Maio V, V

an empirical study of primary ca Eckman MH, Wise R, Leonard AC educational intervention in patie El-Jawahri A, Podgurski LM, Eichl

discussions with patients with car Elwyn G, Frosch D, Thomson R, J decision making: a model for cli

Freeman, R.E. and Auster, E.R. (2) Frosch, D.L., May, S.G., Rendle, N key obstacles to shared decision

Frosch DI Rincon D Ochoa S M Geriatr Soc. 2010 Aug: 58(8):149 Gagliardi, P. (1986). The creation

Greene I Hilbhard IH Sarks P. O. (Millwood), 2015 Mar;34(3):431

Greer L, Fagan A, Coleman E. Reduci Clinical Outcomes Management. 20: Guastello S, Frampton SB. "Patient-C

Settings." Journal of Compassionate Hankinson, T. Development of a slee Hannah, S. T., Schaubroeck, J., Peng. Influences of Individual and Work Ur

Applied Psychology, 98(4), 579-592. Hawker GA, Wright JG, Coyte PC, Wi role of clinical severity and patients' Hebert, P. L., Liu, C.-F., Wong, E.S., I modest economic results for Vetera

Helfrich, C. D., Dolan, E. D., Fihn, S. I team-based care functions and perc Hernandez et al. (2013). Patient-cen Care Management Review, 38(2), 16

Hibbard JH. Greene J. What the evid Health Aff (Millwood). 2013 Feb;32( Higgins, M.C., Weiner, J. and Young, Behavior, 33, 366-388.

Hirschman KB, Shaid E, Bixby MB, Ba Centered Medical Home: Lessons in Hojat M, Louis DZ, Markham FW, W Med. 2011 Mar;86(3):359-64.

Thrahim SA, Hanusa BH, Hannon MT patients with knee osteoarthritis: a r Jabre P, Belpomme V, Azoulay E, Jac Hibon A. Istria J. Beltramini A. Alheri presence during cardiopulmonary re

Karnik, M., Printz, B., & Finkel, J. (20 Health Environments Research & De Kelley JM, Kraft-Todd G, Schapira L, systematic review and meta-analysis Kennedy AD, Sculpher MJ, Coulter A

aids for menorrhagia on treatment of Keren R. Shah SS. Srivastava R. Rang as Luan X, deBerardinis R, Parker A; Pe for postdischarge treatment of acuti-Kotter, J. P. (1995), Leading change: Krumholz HM. Post-hospital syndror

Journal of Management

Sayers, S. L., Riegel, B., F

Behavioral Medicine, 35

Savers, S. L., White, T., 2

Schaubroeck, J.M., Hann

culture influences on eth

Schein, E.H. (2010), Org.

Schimmel, R. and Munts

change. Human Resource

Shepley, M., Harris, D.,

Design Conference. Retr

Shortell SM, Sehgal NJ,

Engage Patients and The

Simons, T. (1999), Behav

Singer SJ, Vogus TJ. Redi

Smith, M.E. (2003). Char

Soparnot, R. (2011), The

Stacey D, Légaré F, Col N

Decision aids for people

12(2), 89-104.

24(5), 249-261,

317-24.

Lim. L. and Zimring. C. Healthcare Dr. Longenecker CO, Longenecker PD. V 92 Lukas CV, Holmes SK, Cohen AB, Res organizational model. Health Care N

Luttik M. I. Jaarsma T. Moser D. patients with heart failure: an overv McClelland, L. E. & Gabriel, A. (2016) McClelland, L.E., & Vogus, TJ, (2014 patient perceptions? Health Service: Melkonian, T. (2005). Top executive:

Organization, 34(4), 7-28. Meyer, J. P. et al. (2007). Employee Journal of Occupational and Organiz Meyers TA, Eichhorn DJ, Guzzetta CE Am J Nurs. 2000 Feb;100(2):32-42;0

Navlor M.D. Hirschman KB. O'Connor Eff Res. 2013 Sep;2(5):457-68. Nelson K. M., Helfrich C., Sun H., H. in the Veterans Health Administration Older Adults With Type 2 Diabetes N

Phillips, M, Lorie, A, Kelley, JM, Gray Person Centered Healthcare, 2013; Public Health Research Institute and Health and Social services Centers i

Quan, X., Joseph, A., & Ensign, J. C. (2012). Impact of Imaging Room Environment: Staff Job Stress and Satisfaction, Patient Satisfaction, and Willingness To Recommend. Health Environments Research & Design Journal (HERD) (Vendome Group LLC), 5(2), 61-79. Raelin, J.D. et Cataldo, C. (2011). Whither middle management? Empowering interface and the failure of organizational change. Journal of

Change Management, 11(4), 481-507. Rakel D, Barrett B, Zhang Z, Hoeft T, Chewning B, Marchand L, Scheder J. Perception of empathy in the therapeutic encounter: effects on the common cold. Patient Educ Couns. 2011 Dec:85(3):390-7.

Riess H. Kelley JM. Bailey R. Konowitz PM. Gray ST. Improving empathy and relational skills in otolary neology residents; a pilot study Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg. 2011 Jan;144(1):120-2.

Riess H, Kelley JM, Bailey RW, Dunn EJ, Phillips M. Empathy training for resident physicians: a randomized controlled trial of a neuroscience-

Riess. H. The Impact of Clinical Empathy on Patients and Clinicians: Understanding empathy's side effects. American Journal of Bioethics Neuroscience, 2015;

Rippin AS, Zimring C, Samuels O, Denham MEZ. Finding a Middle Ground: Exploring the Impact of Patient- and Family-Centered Design on Nurse-Family Interactions in the Neuro ICU, HERD, 2015 Fall:9(1):80-98, doi: 10.1177/1937586715593551, Epub 2015 Jul 17 Rollins, J. A. (2009). The Influence of Two Hospitals' Designs and Policies on Social Interaction and Privacy as Coping Factors for Children With

Cancer and Their Families. Journal of Pediatric Oncology Nursing, 26(6), 340-353. http://doi.org/10.1177/1043 Rosemond CA, Hanson LC, Ennett ST, Schenck AP, Weiner BJ. Implementing person-centered care in nursing homes. Health Care Manage Rev.

2012 Jul-Sep;37(3):257-66. doi: 10.1097/HMR.0b013e318235ed17. Rosland AM, Kieffer E, Spencer M, Sinco B, Palmisano G, Valerio M, Nicklett E, Heisler M. Do pre-existing diabetes social support or depressive

symptoms influence the effectiveness of a diabetes management intervention? Patient Educ Couns. 2015 Nov;98(11):1402-9.
Rosland AM, Piette JD, Choi H, Heisler M. Family and friend participation in primary care visits of patients with diabetes or heart failure: patient and physician determinants and experiences. Med Care. 2011 Jan;49(1):37-45

Rosland AM, Piette JD. Emerging models for mobilizing family support for chronic disease management: a structured review. Chronic Illn. 2010 Mar;6(1):7-21.

Rosland, A. M., Piette, J. D., Lyles, C. R., Parker, M. M., Moffet, H. H., Adler, N. E., ... Karter, A. J. (2014). Social support and lifestyle vs. medical diabetes self-management in the Diabetes Study of Northern California (DISTANCE). Annals of Behaviora

Rosland, A.-M., Heisler, M., Janevic, M. R., Connell, C. M., Langa, K. M., Kerr, E. A., & Piette, J. D. (2013). Current and potential support for chronic disease management in the United States: the perspective of family and friends of chronically ill adu Rosland, A.-M., Heisler, M., & Piette, J. D. (2012). The impact of family behaviors and communication patterns on chronic illness outcomes: a

systematic review, Journal of Behavioral Medicine, 35(2), 221-239, http://doi.org/10.1007/s10865-011-9854-4 Rosland, A.-M. (2009). Sharing the Care:The Role of Family in Chronic Illness. California Health Care Foundation

Rosland, A.-M., Heisler, M., Choi, H.-J., Silveira, M. J., & Piette, J. D. (2010). Family influences on self-management among functionally independent adults with diabetes or heart failure; do family members hinder as much as they help? Chronic Illness, 6

Veterans Health Admini Tai-Seale M, Elwyn G, Wilson CJ, Stults C, Dillon EC, Li M, Chuang J, Meehan A, Frosch DL. Enhancing Shared Decision Making Through Carefully Rouleau, L. (2005), Micr.

in the restrict of the restric Role of Relational Coordination, Med Decis Making, 2015 Nov; 35(8):987-98. Tummers, L., Kruven, P. M., Vliverberg, D. M. and Voesenek, T. J. (2015). Connecting HRM and change management: the importance of

proactivity and vitality. Journal of Organizational Change Management, 28(4). 627 – 640. Veroff D, Marr A, Wennberg DE. Enhanced support for shared decision making reduced costs of care for patients with preference-sensitive conditions. Health Aff (Millwood). 2013 Feb;32(2):285-93.

Vogus, T. J., & McClelland, L. E. (2016). When the customer is the patient: Lessons from healthcare research on patient satisfaction and service

quality ratings. Human Resource Management Review, 26(1), 37-49.
Volandes AE, Paasche-Orlow MK, Mitchell SL, El-Jawahri A, Davis AD, Barry MJ, Hartshorn KL, Jackson VA, Gillick MR, Walker-Corkery ES, Chang Y, López L, Kemeny M, Bulone L, Mann E, Misra S, Peachey M, Abbo ED, Eichler AF, Epstein AS, Noy A, Levin TT, Temel JS. Randomi

Ulrich RS. Berry LL. Quan X. Parish JT. A conceptual framework for the domain of evidence-based design. HERD. 2010 Fall:4(1):95-114.

Kenneth Warm, The Influence of A Patient-Centered Medical Home on Healthy Communities/Enhancement of Life's Journey. Presented at the 2015 Planetree Patient Centered Care International Conference, Chicago, IL. Wennberg DE, Marr A, Lang L, O'Malley S, Bennett G. A randomized trial of a telephone care-management strategy. N Engl J Med. 2010 Sep

Wesler, RM 141 (2015) Patient responses to decision aids in the United States, Int J of Pers Cent Med, 5 (3), 105-111.

Werkman, R. (2009). Understanding failure to change: A pluralistic approach and five patterns. Leader ship and Organization Development

Williams JA, Meltzer D, Arora V, Chung G, Curlin FA. Attention to inpatients' religious and spiritual concerns: predictors and association with

patient satisfaction. J Gen Intern Med. 2011 Nov;26(11):1265-71. Wilson SR, Strub P, Buist AS, Knowles SB, Lavori PW, Lapidus J, Vollmer WM: Better Outcomes of Asthma Treatment (BOAT) Study Group

Shared treatment decision making improves adherence and outcomes in poorly controlled asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2010 Mar

Wolff, J. L., & Roter, D. L., Family presence in routine medical visits: A meta-analytical review, Social Science & Medicine (2011),

Stamp, K. D., Dunbar, S. Wolff, J. L., & Roter, D. L. (2008). Hidden in plain sight: medical visit companions as a resource for vulnerable older adults. Archives of Interna Medicine, 188(13), 1409–1415. http://doi.org/10.1001/archinte.168.13.1409 care confidence and trea

Outcomes." Health Envi Stone, S. Patient Falls Reduction Initiative, Sharp Healthcare, Annual Nursing Report, 2011.

Strom, J. L., & Egede, L. E. (2012). The impact of social support on outcomes in adult patients with type 2 diabetes: a systematic review. Current Diabetes Reports, 12(6), 769-781. http://doi.org/10.1007/s11892-012-0817-0



## Opportunities

- Widely accepted definition of Patient/Family Engagement remains fairly narrow
- Limitations of traditional scales for rating the quality of research
  - Opportunity to elevate the credibility of experience-based research closely aligned with the priorities and experiences of patients/families
- Need for greater inclusion and proactive engagement of underserved, "hard-to-reach," and "complex" patients and their caregivers
- Need for further exploration of opportunities to strengthen and expand the evidence-base focused on:
  - Effectiveness of training to expand partnership capabilities of patients and families
  - Effectiveness of patient engagement in large-scale healthcare quality improvement efforts, i.e. relationships between outcomes and degree of co-design
  - Extent to which experiential learning creates sustained changes in behavior of healthcare team members

